

# EQUITABLE DEVELOPMENT RUBRIC

Cincinnati aspires to be a fair and equitable place to live. This evaluation tool stems from an effort to make sure this goal is at the forefront of our public decisions about development. It is designed to score proposed development projects by their contributions toward equity across class and race in our city.

The rubric's 4 main categories form its core. Jobs and Labor and Community Input apply to all projects; Housing Affordability and Community Footprint are applied based on certain criteria. Each category is scored on a 4-pt scale.

Any project that scores at least 50% of points across all applicable main categories is eligible to earn Extra Credit points, based on the criteria listed.

This tool is intended for use by a number of different folks— citizens, community councils, developers, and city officials.

## Citizens and Community

Use this rubric to learn about and impact projects proposed in your neighborhood and city.

Get involved! Ask questions, suggest solutions, and make informed decisions when you are asked for your support.

This information is power— use your civic voice to steer our city in the right direction!

## Developers

Use this rubric to better understand how projects fit with necessary progress steps toward equity in Cincinnati.

Apply it to your own projects. Offer communities honest assessments, and commit to delivering community benefits in return for public subsidies, incentives, and support.

## City Officials

Use this rubric to ensure a return for our public resources that advances our city's equity.

Incorporate this framework into our legislation and public practice, and invest in basic structures for monitoring and accountability.

# HOUSING AFFORDABILITY

This section is meant to be used for projects that include significant residential development.

When evaluating a project that does not include residential units, the Score 1 column criteria may be used to award a bonus point.

0 pts.	1 pt.	2 pts.	3 pts.	4 pts.
Project is exclusively market rate, and no significant contribution will be made to Affordable Housing Trust Fund	Project is exclusively market rate, but includes significant financial contribution (equal to 10% of project's tax liability on top of existing CPS and VTICA payment requirements) to Affordable Housing Trust Fund.	EITHER At least 25% of project units are affordable at 60% Area Median Income (AMI) or less OR At least 10% of project units are affordable at 30% AMI or less	EITHER At least 35% of project units are affordable at 60% AMI or less OR At least 15% of project units are affordable at 30% AMI or less	EITHER At least 65% of project units are affordable at 60% AMI or less OR At least 30% of project units are affordable at 30% AMI or less

\*These affordable units must be priced and reserved for income-qualified tenants, using HUD calculations and adjustments for the area's median gross income.

\*2 bonus points are awarded if the on-site affordable units are financed without the use of dedicated public funding/resources for affordable housing.

Score:

# JOBS AND LABOR

This section is meant to be used for all projects.

A score of 3 or 4 is only attainable for projects that will generate a significant number of new, post-construction jobs.

0 pts.	1 pt.	2 pts.	3 pts.	4 pts.
<p>Project offers no commitment to ethical labor standards beyond basic applicable labor laws</p>	<p>BOTH                      Project abides by Cincinnati’s Wage Theft Ordinance and all other applicable labor laws                      AND                      All contractors used throughout the construction process meet Ohio Prevailing Wage Contractor Responsibilities</p>	<p>BOTH                      Criteria in Score 1 column are met                      AND                      All contractors used throughout the construction process meet Cincinnati’s Responsible Bidder criteria and requirements</p>	<p>BOTH                      Criteria in Score 1 column are met                      AND                      Post construction, owner of development and all commercial tenants pay a <i>majority</i> of their employees at least the local living wage rates established by the City of Cincinnati, AND meet the criteria for federal Section 3 Business Concerns</p>	<p>BOTH                      Criteria in Score 1 column are met                      AND                      Post construction, owner of development and all commercial tenants pay <i>all</i> adult employees at least the local living wage rates established by the City of Cincinnati, AND meet the criteria for federal Section 3 Business Concerns</p>

Score:

# COMMUNITY INPUT

This section is meant to be used for all projects.

0 pts.	1 pt.	2 pts.	3 pts.	4 pts.
<p>Developer does not plan to engage local, low-income residents outside of community council visit(s) requested/required by the city</p>	<p><b>BOTH</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>In addition to presentation at community council, developer holds a public input session that meets the following standards:                             <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>* Held during evening or weekend hours</li> <li>* Advance notice given to community council and other community anchor institutions</li> <li>* Held at location within walking distance of development site</li> <li>* Held at ADA accessible venue</li> </ul> </li> </ul> <p><b>AND</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Project plans thereafter reflect a good faith effort to incorporate the resulting community input, and are re-presented at community council</li> </ul>	<p><b>BOTH</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Criteria in Score 1 column are met</li> </ul> <p><b>AND</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>An alternative input mechanism (ex. survey) is made easily accessible to all stakeholders based within 5 minutes walking distance to development site</li> </ul>	<p><b>BOTH</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Criteria in Score 1 column are met</li> </ul> <p><b>AND</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Secures project support from a majority of non-profit organizations in the development neighborhood (and/or adjacent neighborhoods) that primarily serve a low-income population</li> </ul>	<p><b>BOTH</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Criteria in Score 1 column are met</li> </ul> <p><b>AND</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Local, low-income residents hold at least 20% of positions within the project's governing board with decision-making power over project design, siting, development, and management</li> </ul>

Score:

# COMMUNITY FOOTPRINT

This section is meant to be used if the proposed development site, at the time of the developer's purchase, included any assets that served a public/community need or good. Such assets include, but are not limited to: recreation space; green space; social gathering space; small, neighborhood-serving business; social services; housing; trees and vegetation

0 pts.	1 pt.	2 pts.	3 pts.	4 pts.
<p>Project offers no plans to preserve or replace existing community asset(s)</p>	<p>Project replaces and relocates the asset(s), at equal or greater value</p> <p>IF, AND ONLY IF, BOTH</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The new location is within 5 minutes walking distance of site</li> </ul> <p>AND</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Robust support for the relocation plan is secured from residents and community stakeholders in the immediate area</li> </ul> <p>*In order to earn this point, a minimum of Score 3 should be earned in the Community Input category</p>	<p>Project arranges for the continued existence of the asset(s), in place and at levels of capacity, affordability, and accessibility comparable to, or better than, those pre-development</p>	<p>BOTH</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Project meets criteria in Score 2 column</li> </ul> <p>AND</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Integrates design plans with existing asset(s) to support and strengthen use and quality of community benefit</li> </ul>	<p>BOTH</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Project meets criteria in Score 3 column</li> </ul> <p>AND</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Developer contributes significant in-kind or financial contribution (equal to 10% of project's tax liability on top of existing CPS and VTICA payment requirements) to further the positive community impact of the asset(s)</li> </ul>

Score:

# EXTRA CREDIT

This section is meant to account for important community benefits not represented in the main 4 sections. Projects that score a minimum of 50% in the main 4 sections are eligible to earn Extra Credit points according to the corresponding criteria. Extra Credit points will be counted in the project's total score. Each Extra Credit category occupies a row below. Projects may not score points in more than one column per category.

	1 pt.	2 pts.	3 pts.	4 pts.
<h2>Diversity and Inclusion</h2>	<p>Owner of development and all commercial tenants meet the contractor requirements and criteria in the City of Cincinnati's Equal Employment Opportunity Program</p>	<p><b>BOTH</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Criterion in Score 1 column is met</li> </ul> <p><b>AND</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• At least 1 commercial tenant org. within the development qualifies as a Minority Business Enterprise (MBE), Women Business Enterprise (WBE), or Minority Women Business Enterprise (MWBE) as defined in the Cincinnati Municipal Code</li> </ul>	<p><b>BOTH</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Criterion in Score 1 column is met</li> </ul> <p><b>AND</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Either the developer qualifies, or a majority of commercial tenant orgs. within the development qualify as MBE's, WBE's, or MWBE's as defined in the Municipal Code</li> </ul>	<p><b>ALL OF THE FOLLOWING:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Criterion in Score 1 column is met</li> <li>• Project meaningfully incorporates the 7 principles of universal design</li> <li>• Project provides space available for use by the general public</li> </ul>
<h2>Public Space and Infrastructure</h2> <p><small>*Note: In order to earn 3 or 4 points in this category, a project must also earn 4 points in the Community Footprint category and at least 3 points in the Community Input category</small></p>	<p>Developer makes a significant in-kind or financial contribution (equal to 10% of project's tax liability on top of existing CPS and VTICA payment requirements) to the city in general support of public spaces and amenities</p>	<p>Developer makes a significant in-kind or financial contribution (equal to 10% of project's tax liability on top of existing CPS and VTICA payment requirements) in direct support of a public space or amenity located in a primarily low-income area of Cincinnati</p>	<p><b>BOTH</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• As its primary purpose, the project develops or redevelops a public space or amenity</li> </ul> <p><b>AND</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The resulting public asset remains public in its ownership and governance, and is accessible, affordable, and welcoming to people of all income levels</li> </ul>	<p><b>BOTH</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Criteria in Score 3 column are met</li> </ul> <p><b>AND</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The resulting public asset is located in a primarily low-income area of Cincinnati</li> </ul>

**Score:**

# EXTRA CREDIT

This section is meant to account for important community benefits not represented in the main 4 sections. Any project that meets the criteria below may be awarded the corresponding Extra Credit points, to be counted in its total score. Each category occupies a row below. Projects may not score points in more than one column per category.

	1 pt.	2 pts.	3 pts.	4 pts.
<b>Natural Environment</b>	Project is certified LEED Silver	Project is certified LEED Gold or Platinum	Project is Living Building Petal certified	Project is Living Building Full certified
<b>Community Organizations and Programs</b>	Developer offers a significant financial or in-kind contribution to a program, project, or org. with the primary purpose of meeting an established community need not already accounted for in this rubric AND Low-income Cincinnati residents will be directly served by this organization	Project provides full-time space for a nonprofit or community-based org. with the primary purpose of meeting an established community need not already accounted for in this rubric AND Low-income Cincinnati residents will be directly served by this organization	At least half of the project is utilized full-time by a nonprofit or community-based org. with the primary purpose of meeting an established community need not already accounted for in this rubric AND Low-income Cincinnati residents will be directly served by this organization	Project is owned and occupied by a nonprofit or community-based org. with the primary purpose of meeting an established community need not already accounted for in this rubric AND Low-income Cincinnati residents will be directly served by this organization

Score:

# EXTRA CREDIT

This section is meant to account for important community benefits not represented in the main 4 sections. Any project that meets the criteria below may be awarded the corresponding Extra Credit points, to be counted in its total score. Each category occupies a row below. Projects may not score points in more than one column per category.

	1 pt.	2 pts.	3 pts.	4 pts.
Local Enterprise	No less than 30% of the project's contract work is awarded to Emerging Local Business Enterprises (ELBE) or Small Local Business Enterprises (SLBE), as defined in the Cincinnati Municipal Code	The project provides commercial space to an ELBE or SLBE committed to significant local sourcing and procurement within their business model	The developer qualifies as an ELBE or SLBE, as defined in the Cincinnati Municipal Code OR The majority of the project's financing comes from a lending institution with at least a moderate rating by Bank Local	The project provides commercial space to a worker-owned cooperative

Score: